## PUBLIC TRANSPORT OMBUDSMAN ANNUAL REPORT 2015

 $\bigcirc$ 

PUBLIC TRANSPORT OMBUDSMAN LIMITED





## **INDEPENDENCE,** FAIRNESS AND ACCOUNTABILITY

The Public Transport Ombudsman (PTO) is a not-for-profit, independent dispute resolution body providing free, fair and informal service for the resolution of complaints about Victorian public transport operators who are members of the PTO scheme.

### **PTO scheme members**

Public Transport Victoria (PTV) BusVic Metro Trains Melbourne (Metro) Southern Cross Station Transdev Melbourne V/Line VicTrack Yarra Trams

We comply with the Benchmarks for Industrybased Customer Dispute Resolution Schemes which are; Accessibility, Independence, Fairness, Accountability, Efficiency and Effectiveness. Our Charter requires us to have our performance reviewed against these benchmarks every five years. Last year our performance was independently reviewed by Cameron RalphNavigator. The Scheme was found to be operating soundly and in a manner consistent with these benchmarks; with minor improvement opportunities identified. The PTO has been operating since 2004. We have handled over 25,000 approaches and investigated over 3,200 complaints.

The recommendations for improvement included the PTO increasing its accessibility and awareness related activities, working more effectively with stakeholders and improving some areas of its operation to be more efficient.

The PTO Board responded positively to these recommendations and related activities are now underway. Full details can be found at **ptovic.com.au** 

# OUR VISION

We contribute to improving how public transport services meet the needs of the **Victorian Community** 

# OUR VALUES

Excellence Integrity Leadership Respect Independence

# CONTENTS

- 8 Chair's report
- Ombudsman's report 10
- 13 Board
- Our process 14
- Number and type of approaches 16
- 18 Top issues
- Approaches and complaints by PTO member 21
- Exploring the top complaint issues 23
- Working with our members to improve the system 29
- Working with the community 36
- Other activities related to our work 41
- How we performed 42
- Our people 43
- Financial report 44

### NUMBER OF APPROACHES TO THE PTO

# 4,079 TOTAL APPROACHES 976 RELATED TO **NON MEMBERS** 473 REQUESTS FOR INFORMATION **1332 COMPLAINTS**

672 CONSUMERS **HELPED** by the PTO to escalate their complaint with the member

626 INVESTIGATIONS **CONDUCTED BY PTO** 672 INVESTIGATIONS **FINALISED** 

### CHAIR'S REPORT

### THE PAST YEAR HAS BEEN ONE OF CHANGE, CONSOLIDATION AND ACHIEVEMENT FOR THE PUBLIC TRANSPORT OMBUDSMAN VICTORIA.

The most significant change was the departure of Janine Young from the role of Ombudsman and her replacement by Treasure Jennings two months later.

Janine left in October 2014 to take on the role of Energy & Water Ombudsman, New South Wales. During her four years as the Public Transport Ombudsman, Janine steered the scheme through a period of great change in the public transport industry which saw the establishment of Public Transport Victoria and the implementation of myki. Having skillfully addressed many challenges, Janine left the PTO in a very strong position.

After an extensive recruitment process, the Board selected Treasure as Janine's replacement. Treasure has extensive experience in a number of public and private sector roles and we were delighted to secure such an outstanding candidate. From the time she took up the role in December, Treasure began building on Janine's work in a number of significant ways, which she details in her own report. I would also like to acknowledge the excellent performance of our Operations Manager, Simon McKenzie, as Acting Ombudsman in the period between Janine's departure and Treasure's arrival. All three individuals deserve credit for such a seamless transition.

There was also significant change at Board level in 2014-15. The Consumer Director vacancy, which existed at the start of the financial year, was filled in September by the appointment of Dianne Rule. In December, two Industry Directors, Leah Waymark and Chris Lowe, left the board. Leah and Chris had been outstanding directors, making incisive contributions to the Board's deliberations. They were replaced by Theo Taifalos and Peter Kavanagh both of whom, along with Dianne, have already proved to be excellent additions to the Board. While there have been significant changes in personnel, in terms of the PTO's operations, the past year has been one of consolidation. In the recent past, major changes in public transport contributed to PTO case numbers increasing over a two year period from 1,838 in 2010-11 to 4,377 in 2012-13. Since then, a more stable operating environment and a number of customer-friendly initiatives has seen a modest downward trend, with this report showing a further slight decline in case numbers from 4,142 in 2013-14 to 4,079 in the past twelve months. PTO staff have continued to deal with all matters in a professional and timely manner.

The more stable operating environment has also assisted the Board in budget forecasting. This annual report shows that the scheme operated with a \$49,595 surplus in 2014-15, and with an annual budget which remains below \$2 million, the PTO represents excellent value for money. This year, the PTO's accounts have been audited for the first time by Grant Thornton and we appreciate the professional way in which they have undertaken their work.

The past year has also seen the completion of an independent review of the scheme's performance which pleasingly found that the PTO was operating effectively, but made a number of recommendations about specific areas where improvements could be made. The Board accepted these recommendations and the Ombudsman has been working on their implementation.

As this is my final Chair's report, I would like to take the opportunity to thank all those who have assisted me in my three and a half years in the role. The two Ministers for Public Transport in that time, Terry Mulder and Jacinta Allan, have both shown strong support for the scheme. All the industry members of the scheme have always taken a keen interest in the PTO's work and I have appreciated the time industry CEOs gave to meet with the Ombudsman and me and how helpful they have been. Also I know that a number of consumer organisations have contributed significantly to the PTO in recent years.

To all the PTO staff, thank you for your dedication, professionalism and for your friendly interaction with the Board. I would particularly like to thank the Ombudsman's Executive Assistant, Sophie Scully who has the unenviable task of scheduling meetings in the busy diaries of our Board members, but does so with unfailing enthusiasm and good humour.

I would like to thank all the directors I have worked with, both when I was a Consumer Director and as Chair. You have all made valuable contributions and I have appreciated your support and friendship. Special mention must be made of our company secretary, Bernard Stute who has been in this role since the scheme's inception. His corporate knowledge, attention to detail and considered judgement are invaluable assets to the organisation.

Finally, to the two Ombudsmen, Janine and Treasure, it has been a pleasure working with you. The PTO has certainly had its challenges in recent years, but its reputation as an independent and respected part of the public transport landscape in this state, is in no small part due to your efforts.

My term as Chair of the Board is finishing on 31 October 2015. I congratulate incoming Chair, Kay Rundle, on her appointment and wish her, and all those involved with the PTO, every success in the future.

I have pleasure in presenting the annual report for 2014-15.

Ruh Ally.

Richard Allsop Chair Public Transport Ombudsman Limited



The scheme operated with a \$49,595 surplus in 2014-15, and with an annual budget which remains below \$2 million, the PTO represents excellent value for money.

## **OMBUDSMAN'S REPORT** THE YEAR IN REVIEW

I'm very proud and humbled to be appointed Victoria's fourth Public Transport Ombudsman. Like many Victorians I rely on public transport for my daily commute to work and for other recreational activities and I also have children who have been regular bus, train and tram users for a number of years. Reliable and safe public transport is a very important component of my family's daily life and I am passionate about the ongoing contribution the PTO makes to improving public transport in Victoria.

Public transport has been a hot topic for Victorians for a number of years; arguably the level of this year's dialogue on the topic has reached an all-time high. With major infrastructure projects announced, new regional services and high profile challenges to transport fines, public transport receives almost daily media coverage. This report forms another part of the dialogue on public transport and contains stories and insights into the experiences of the community.

The PTO's role is to assist consumers with information and referral, and when necessary, investigate matters that the consumer has been unable to satisfactorily resolve directly with the public transport operator. We look for what is fair and reasonable in the circumstances, so understanding the needs of a variety of different people is very important. We know Victoria's public transport system is a mass transit system designed to move a lot of people as quickly as possible, but sometimes the system and rules don't work for a person because of their personal circumstances. This report includes case studies highlighting some of the difficulties faced by people with special circumstances.

I am delighted to report that the organisation is performing well against its key performance targets and we have made significant improvements to customer satisfaction through enhancing our efficiency and skills. Thanks must go to my predecessor Janine Young, who led the organisation for just over four years. I have inherited a professional and efficient scheme with highly skilled and dedicated staff. I must also thank PTO Operations Manager, Simon McKenzie, for the great job he did as Acting Ombudsman prior to my appointment.

Since becoming Ombudsman I have focused on strengthening relationships with our member organisations. By working in a more collaborative way we are able to get better outcomes for public transport users in Victoria. In particular, I'm keen to make sure that when my office observes a broader issue that might be affecting a number of consumers we're able to work constructively with that member to get things fixed, so we've made some changes to support that process. Firstly, we use our complaint data to uncover potential improvement opportunities and this year we have worked with our members and found four improvement opportunities. Secondly, we have established a myki issues register designed to assist PTV in uncovering myki system or policy related issues that can be addressed reasonably guickly. This year we found three myki issues requiring corrective actions, two are closed and one requires further investigation. As in the past, we also use our information to identify broader systemic concerns and seek action from the member responsible to address the problem. The PTO identified four systemic issues, three of these now have corrective actions in place and one remains open.

The PTO plays an important consumer protection role, providing a free and informal access to justice pathway for consumers with complaints about public transport. In its 2014 inquiry report, Access to Justice Arrangements, the Productivity Commission confirmed the importance and effectiveness of industry-based Ombudsman schemes such as the PTO. This year 4079 consumers approached my office for information, advice and assistance in resolving their complaint. This is only slightly less than last year's figure of 4142 approaches; however we've recorded a 10% increase in escalated complaints and a 14% increase in new investigations undertaken from the previous year. This suggests that even with improved internal dispute resolution through the introduction of a customer advocate within PTV, many consumers are still turning to the PTO for an independent and fair outcome when their complaint remains unresolved.

This year has also seen the introduction of the penalty fare option on a 12 month trial basis. The penalty fare is an on-the-spot payment option of \$75 which is offered to consumers as an alternative to being recommended for a fine of up to \$223. Although I can't investigate disputes relating to fines or failed appeals of fines, I can consider complaints relating to penalty fares because they are administered by PTV. This year the PTO spoke to 189 people with complaints about penalty fares and conducted 38 investigations. Dealing with fare evasion is a difficult task however I have developed the view that the penalty fare option has room for improvement if it is to be retained. As the trial period is now over, PTV is in the process of reviewing the penalty fare option and I'm pleased to report that insights from consumer's complaints and the PTO's suggestions are being considered. (continued over)

> "...even with improved internal dispute resolution through the introduction of a customer advocate within PTV, many consumers are still turning to the PTO for an independent and fair outcome when their complaint remains unresolved."



## **OMBUDSMAN'S REPORT** THE YEAR IN REVIEW (cont)

During 2014 the PTO's performance was independently reviewed against the Benchmarks for Industry-based Customer Dispute Resolution Schemes (CDR Benchmarks) and, pleasingly, was found to be operating soundly against those benchmarks of efficiency, effectiveness, fairness, accountability, accessibility and independence. A number of minor improvement opportunities were recommended, all of which have been adopted.

**PTO's performance** was independently reviewed against the Benchmarks for Industry-based **Customer Dispute Resolution Schemes** (CDR Benchmarks) and, pleasingly, was found to be operating soundly.

The review also highlighted the need for the PTO to ensure that people who might need our service know about it. I'm looking at ways to build awareness of the scheme through the use of social media and also through those important community stakeholders who represent members of the community who rely heavily on public transport to facilitate their everyday needs.

Simultaneously, a review of the relevance of the CDR Benchmarks to industry-based dispute resolution schemes was undertaken by the Commonwealth Consumer Affairs Advisory Council (CCAAC). The CCAAC found the CDR Benchmarks continue to be relevant in promoting best-practice and continuous improvement; therefore the PTO will continue to independently test its performance against these benchmarks every five years as set out in the PTO Charter.

Finally I would like to thank the member and community stakeholders for generously and openly supporting my transition into this role. More importantly, even though we sometimes see things differently, I am impressed with the manner in which our stakeholders embrace the independence of this office and accept the PTO's decisions as fair and reasonable.

The PTO Board has also provided me with invaluable guidance and strategic leadership and they remain committed to executing their duties in a highly ethical and professional manner. Richard Allsop has been a very strong Chair and previously Consumer Director, and his contribution to the PTO over the past four years has been invaluable. I consider myself very fortunate to have worked with Richard in this capacity and thank him for his dedication and hard work personally and on behalf of the previous Ombudsmen Janine Young.

Vreeerk

Treasure Jennings Ombudsman. Public Transport Ombudsman Limited

### **MEMBERS** OF THE PTO BOARD

Company

Secretary



Consumer Director

> Consumer Director

> > Industry Director

Chairman

Ombudsman

Industry Director

Consumer Director

Industry Director

### OUR **PROCESS**

### The PTO has six different processes depending upon the reason a consumer has approached us.

### 1. Information requests

General enquiries about public transport or the role of the PTO which are handled by PTO staff on a case by case basis.

### 2. Refer to Member Enquiries

Consumer information requests about a member service which are referred to the operator for response.

### 3. Refer to Public Transport Victoria, Department of Transport or other bodies

Enquiries or complaints that are outside the PTO's jurisdiction; usually about ticket infringements or high level public transport policy.

### 4. Refer to Member Complaints

Complaints about operator service where the consumer is seeking resolution but hasn't first given the operator the opportunity to resolve the complaint. The consumer is referred back to the member.

### 5. Refer for Internal Escalation (RFIE)

Complaints about operator service where a consumer has spoken to a member at least once and hasn't received a satisfactory response, but is happy to keep dealing directly with the operator, rather than have the PTO investigate.

Complaints are documented and then referred to an operator's Customer Service Team for response and resolution.

The operator must contact the consumer within one business day to acknowledge the referral. They must investigate the complaint and provide the consumer with a thorough response within seven business days.

The PTO might escalate a complaint where the consumer has not contacted the operator if the complaint contains complex issues, is about Authorised Officers or where the consumer might need assistance outlining their complaint.

### 6. PTO Investigations

The PTO registers and investigates where the consumer has raised concerns with the operator without resolution or when the PTO exercises its discretion to investigate because of the circumstances of the complaint or the consumer.

Complaint issues and the consumer's proposed resolution are documented and then the operator's Customer Service Team is asked for a response and supporting documentation. The response must be provided to the PTO within 14 days.

The PTO will then assess the response and conciliate an agreed resolution to the complaint if possible.

Complaints may be escalated or ultimately determined by the Ombudsman if no agreed resolution is reached.

### The PTO uses a conciliation model when determining the appropriate outcome for the consumer.

This means we try and work towards AN AGREED OUTCOME between the member and the consumer. We consider laws and what would be FAIR AND REASONABLE in the circumstances.

codes as a minimum standard and also consider

We take into consideration **PREVIOUS CASES**, the **OPINION OF OTHER OPERATORS** and the CIRCUMSTANCES OF THE CONSUMER, and we try to GATHER EVIDENCE such as CCTV footage or myki records.

If the parties don't agree we then **DETERMINE** AN OUTCOME. The Ombudsman can bind a member to her decision up to the value of \$5000 or \$10,000 by agreement with the member.

The Ombudsman can also discontinue an investigation if the consumer's claim is **UNREASONABLE** or UNSUBSTANTIATED.

### NUMBER & TYPE OF APPROACHES **TO THE PTO**

This year 4079 consumers approached to the PTO, compared with 4142 in the previous year. This was the first full year in which the industry initiative, the Public Transport Victoria Customer Advocate role, operated.

From 1 December 2013, consumers approaching an Operator member of the PTO Scheme or Public Transport Victoria with a complaint were provided the Customer Advocate's contact details as well as ours. The initiative did not result in a significant decrease in complaints received at the PTO during the year. Of the 4079 approaches, a greater proportion required investigation which may be indicative of an environment that increased in complexity.

976 approaches were for enquires or complaints relating to non-members, a slight increase from the previous year.

# **626 investigations** were conducted by the PTO, **a significant 14% increase** from 548 in 2013/2014.

The introduction of penalty fares as an enforcement measure from 1 August 2014 resulted in a marked increase in the complexity of matters consumers brought to the PTO. Some complaints may contain more than one issue type, depending on the complexity and detail of the consumer's experience prior to, during and after the incident that caused them to complain.

# This year the PTO recorded **1,286 issues** within the 626 investigations received.

THIS COMPARES WITH 1,027 ISSUES WITHIN 548 INVESTIGATIONS IN 2013/2014.

# ◇ 90% ◇ 43%

### INCREASE IN ENQUIRIES AND COMPLAINTS RELATED TO FINES RECEIVED ON THE PUBLIC TRANSPORT NETWORK.

INCREASE IN APPROACHES RELATED TO APPEALING A FINE.

The PTO assisted consumers with these types of matters by referring them to the appropriate agency, which in most cases is the Department of Economic Development, Jobs, Transport and Resources within the Victorian Government. 473 consumers approached the PTO for general information, this compares with 514 consumers last year. 1332 consumers complained and were provided advice on escalating their complaint with the PTO member service provider, this compares with 1,540 receiving advice on escalating their complaint last year.

672 consumers needed the PTO's help in escalating their complaint, an increase of 10% from the previous year.

Of the 672 investigations finalised by the PTO, 86% of these were resolved by the agreement of the parties after the PTO conciliated an outcome.

# 86% RESOLVED BY AGREEMENT

THE TYPES OF REDRESS:	51 investi with th
$89^{\%}$ a detailed explanation	
$54^{\%}$ an apology	13 investi complete
$31^{\%}$ a financial gesture or refund	PTO's
$8^{ m \%}$ counselling of a staff member	15 comple exercis
$7^{\%}$ staff retraining	a fair o case di



investigations involving penalty fare issues in 2014/2015.

investigations commenced into complaints about Authorised Officer conduct compared with 23 last year.

igations ceased due to the consumer ceasing contact he PTO.

igations ceased due to the consumer withdrawing their laint after provision of further information about the jurisdiction or process.

laints were discontinued after the PTO assessed the matter and sed its discretion not to investigate the matter further because offer had been made by the Operator or that the consumer's lid not warrant further investigation in the circumstances.

## **TOP ISSUES**

A consumer's complaint may contain more than one issue. Matters consumers bought to us during the year appeared to be more complex and this is reflected by the increase in number of total issues recorded. The sum of issues in the top 5 categories of complaints in 2014/15 was 5218 compared to 4977 in 2013/14. This 5% increase in issues correlates with the total sum of issues in all categories rising from last year's figure of 5764 to 6117 this year.

This table represents the top 25 issues handled by the PTO this year.

Issue Level 1	Issue Level 2	2013/2014	2014/2015	Chai	nge
Staff	Customer Service	331	530	199	60%
Infringement Notice	Fine	255	484	229	90%
myki	Refund / Reimbursement	463	464	1	0%
myki	Staff	354	417	63	18%
myki	Account	435	358	-77	-18%
Infringement Notice	Appeals Process	219	314	95	43%
Infrastructure and Rolling Stock	Trams, Trains, Buses	297	300	3	1%
Infringement Notice	Ticket	239	285	46	19%
Staff	Driver	286	262	-24	-8%
Infrastructure and Rolling Stock	Platform / Shelter / Tram Stop / Bus Stop	187	212	25	13%
Authorised Officer	Behaviour / Approach	180	196	16	9%
Penalty Fare	Accepted / Purchased	-	178	-	-
Service Delivery	Timetable Changes	97	146	49	51%
myki	Terms and Conditions	157	131	-26	-17%
myki	Equipment Trains	155	108	-47	-30%
Service Delivery	Timetables	95	104	9	9%
Service Delivery	Punctuality	165	102	-63	-38%
Service Delivery	Website	78	90	12	15%
myki	myki Card	155	79	-76	-49%
myki	Replacement	97	79	-18	-19%
Staff	Station Attendant	84	75	-9	-11%
Service Delivery	Disruption	99	74	-25	-25%
Service Delivery	Insufficient Service	65	68	3	5%
Service Delivery	Property	51	66	15	29%
Service Delivery	Cancellation	110	65	-45	-41%

### **TOP 5 MAJOR ISSUES CATEGORIES** remained the same as last year; with myki issues still the main reason consumers contact the PTO.

2013/14 MAJOR ISSUES CATEGORY



2014/15 MAJOR ISSUES CATEGORY







# myki issues have decreased by about 8% from last year.This is the second consecutive year that myki issues have decreased

however approaches regarding infringements, staff and infrastructure all increased.

# Looking at issues in more detail:

Approaches regarding infringements are up by **36%** with approaches specifically regarding fines **up by 90%** and the appeals process **up by 43%**.

Approaches regarding staff are **up by 23%** with complaints specifically relating to customer service **up by 60%.** 

Approaches regarding service delivery are **down by 8%** with complaints specifically about cancellations **down by 41%** and punctuality **down by 38%**. Complaints about communication of timetable changes are **up by 51%**.

Approaches regarding infrastructure and rolling stock are **up by 7%.** 

## **Approaches and Complaints** with Issues by PTO Member

BUSVIC	
Approaches Received	
Member - Complaint	
Investigation	
RFIE	
Member - Enquiry	
Total	
Enquiry / Complaint Issues	
Top Issues	
Staff	
Service Delivery	
Infrastructure and Rolling Stock	
Authorised Officer	
Total	
METRO TRAINS	
Approaches Received	
Member - Enquiry	
Member - Complaint	
RFIE	
Investigation	
Total	
Enquiry / Complaint Issues	
Top 5 Issues	
Service Delivery	
Infrastructure and Rolling Stock	
Staff	
Authorised Officer	
Land	
Total	
PUBLIC TRANSPORT VICTORIA	
Approaches Received	
Member - Enquiry	
Member - Complaint	
RFIE	
Investigation	
Total	
Enquiry / Complaint Issues	
Top 5 Issues	
myki	
Staff	
Service Delivery	
Infrastructure and Rolling Stock	
Authorised Officer	
Total	
IVIAI	

1	72
2013/2014	2014/15
111	101
39	40
27	23
12	8
189	172
2013/2014	2014/15
148	154
82	82
41	40
5	3
	279
5	55
<b>5</b> 2013/2014	55 2014/15
2013/2014	2014/15
2013/2014 64	2014/15 42
2013/2014 64 485	2014/15 42 340
2013/2014 64 485 109	2014/15 42 340 113
2013/2014 64 485 109 65	2014/15 42 340 113 60
2013/2014 64 485 109 65	2014/15 42 340 113 60
2013/2014 64 485 109 65 723	2014/15 42 340 113 60 555
2013/2014 64 485 109 65 723 2013/2014	2014/15 42 340 113 60 555 2014/15
2013/2014 64 485 109 65 723 2013/2014 399	2014/15 42 340 113 60 555 2014/15 281
2013/2014 64 485 109 65 723 2013/2014 399 261	2014/15 42 340 113 60 555 2014/15 281 206
2013/2014 64 485 109 65 723 2013/2014 399 261 186	2014/15 42 340 113 60 555 2014/15 281 206 173
2013/2014 64 485 109 65 723 2013/2014 399 261 186 225	2014/15 42 340 113 60 555 2014/15 281 206 173 138

17	/36
2013/2014	2014/15
345	315
668	600
354	345
382	476
1749	1736
2013/2014	2014/15
1976	1782
103	243
181	196
85	179
12	89
	2489

21

Approaches Received42013/20142014/15RFIE31Member - Complaint21Total104TRANSDEV2013/20142014/15Member - Complaint2013/20142014/15Member - Complaint6158Member - Complaint108Member - Complaint112121Total112121Total112121Total112121Total112121Total112121Saff99103Service Delayery5166Infrastructure and Rolling Stock9103Service Delayery5166Infrastructure and Rolling Stock9131Member - Enquiry242014/15Member - Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Member - Complaint Issues3040Total3040Total3040Total3040Total3040Total3040Total3040Total3040Total3040Total3040Total3040Total3040Total3040Total3040Total3040Total3040Total3040Total3040 </th <th>SOUTHERN CROSS STATION</th> <th></th> <th></th>	SOUTHERN CROSS STATION			
Construction2013/20142013/15Member - Complaint21Total04TANSDEV2Member - Complaint21Total08Member - Complaint08Member - Complaint6158Member - Complaint6158Member - Complaint108Member - Complaint112121Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Stoff8910332Stoff8910332Stoff8910332Stoff8910332Member - Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Stoff8910332Member - Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Member - Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Member - Complaint869393Intrastructure and Rolling Stock3040Total133198198Total133198193Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Total133193198Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Member - Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Total1314104Member - Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Member - Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Member - Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Member - Co		4		
Member - Enquiry52RFIE31Member - Complaint21Total104Approaches Received2013/20142014/15Member - Complaint6158RFIE2226Investigation1929Total112121Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff8910332Staff9910332Staff9910332Staff2013/20142014/15Member - Enquiry5166Infrastructure and Rolling Stock1920VILIE2013/20142014/15Member - Enquiry2420Member - Enquiry3040Member - Enquiry104121Staff104121Staff104121Member - Enquiry1040Member - Enquiry1298Member - Enquiry1349Total193198Enquir / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff104121Staff104121Staff104121Staff104121Staff104121Staff104121Staff104121Staff104121Staff104121Staff104121Staff100	Approaches neceiveu		2014/15	
RFIE91Member - Complaint21Total04RANSDEV2013/20142014/15Approaches Received01Member - Enquiry108Member - Complaint6158RFIE2226Investigation1929Total1929Total2013/20142014/15Staff89103Service Delivery5166Infrastructure and Rolling Stock3432VILNE2013/20142014/15Approaches Received9103Member - Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff869393Member - Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Member - Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff939393Prile5345Investigation3040Staff1042014/15Staff1042014/15Staff1042014/15Staff1042014/15Staff1042014/15Staff1042014/15Staff1042014/15Staff1042014/15Staff1042014/15Staff1042014/15Staff1042014/15Staff1042014/15Member - Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff1042014/15 <td>Member Frauin</td> <td></td> <td></td>	Member Frauin			
Member - Complaint21Total04TRANSDEV2Approaches Received2Approaches Received2Member - Complaint658RFIF2226Investigation108Contal1122013/20142013/2014Enquiry10108Member - Complaint Issues22013/20142013/115Enquiry / Complaint Issues22013/20142013/115Staff891033032Service Delivery516666Infrastructure and Rolling Stock343232VINE2013/20142014/153345Member - Enquiry242020Member - Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Member - Complaint Resues2013/20142014/15Staff10412138Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff104121Staff104121Staff1042014/15Staff1042014/15Staff1042014/15Staff1042014/15Member - Enquiry11298Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Land820Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5110Member - Enquiry100Member - Enquiry100Member - Enquiry101			_	
Total104IPAPPRAADES IPACERAPPRAADES Received121Approace2013/2014 <th colspan<="" td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td></th>	<td></td> <td></td> <td></td>			
Paymathes Received         121           Approaches Received         2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         61         58           Merrie         22         26           Investigation         19         29           Total         112         121           Enquiry (Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         89         103           Service Delivery Optimit Issues         34         32           Staff         89         103           Service Delivery Optimit Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         51         66           Member - Enquiry         201         201           Member - Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         104         121           Service Delivery         112         98           Instartucture and Rolling Stock         56         71           Staff         104         121           Service Delivery         112         98           Instartucture and Rolling Stock         56         71			-	
Approaches Received1212013/20142014/15Member - Enquiry618Member - Complaint6158NPE2226Investigation1029Total112121Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff89103Service Delivery Oblight Stock3432Service Delivery Issues2013/20142014/15Member - Enquiry5166Infrastructure and Rolling Stock3432VILNE2013/20142014/15Member - Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff869333NPE5345Investigation3040Total193198Enquiry (Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff104121Service Delivery11298Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Land8201VICTRACK2013/20142014/15Member - Complaint Issues10Member - Enquiry10Member - Enquiry10Member - Enquiry10Member - Enquiry10Member - Enquiry378Member - Enquiry1349Total2013/20142014/15Staff00Total124136RFIE4150Inves	Total	10	4	
2013/20142014/15Member - Complaint618RFIE2226Investigation1929Total112121Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff891033Service Delivery5166Infrastructure and Rolling Stock3432V/LNE2013/20142014/15Member - Enquiry2420Member - Enquiry2420Member - Complaint8693RFIE5345Investigation3040Total1919Breue2013/20142014/15Staff3040Total1919Breue5345Investigation3040Total1314Staff704121Staff7042014/15Staff711Staff2013/20142014/15Staff711Optimatour and Rolling Stock5671Land820Intextor10Member - Complaint21Member - Enquiry10Member - Enquiry10Member - Complaint21RFIE2013/20142014/15Intrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Member - Complaint21Member - Complaint21Member - Enqui	TRANSDEV			
Member - Enquiry108Member - Complaint Result6158PRIE2226Investigation1929Total112121Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff89103Service Delivery5166Offraatructure and Rolling Stock3420VLINE2013/20142014/15Member - Enquiry2420Member - Enquiry2420Member - Complaint Result8693RFIE5345Investigation3040Total193198Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff104121Staff104121Staff104121Staff104121Staff104121Staff104121Staff104121Staff2013/20142014/15Staff104121Member - Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff104121Staff100Member - Enquiry10Member - Enquiry10Member - Enquiry10Member - Complaint Issue11Member - Enquiry10Member - Enquiry10Member - Enquiry10Member - Enquiry1318Member - Enquir	Approaches Received			
Member - Complaint6 158RFIE2226Investigation112121Investigation112121Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff8910366Service Delivery5166Infrastructure and Rolling Stock3420VILNE2013/20142014/15Approaches Received922014/15Member - Complaint8693RFIE5345Investigation3040Total193198Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff104121Service Delivery11298Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Land611010Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Land231410VICTEACK21Approaches Received11Interfactor2013/20142014/15Interfactor21Member - Enquiry10Member - Enquiry10Member - Complaint21Member - Enquiry11Member - Enquiry1337Member - Complaint21Member - Complaint21Member - Complaint337Member - Complaint337Member - Complaint337Member - Complaint				
RFIE         22         26           Investigation         19         29           Total         112         121           Total         112         121           Enquiry / Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         89         103           Service Delivery         51         66           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         34         32           VLINE         2013/2014         2014/15           Approaches Received         198         2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         24         20         40           Member - Complaint         86         93         81           RFIE         53         45         104         121           Devestigation         30         40         40         121           Total         193         198         198         193         198           Enquiry / Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15         15         11           Devestigation         104         121         98         11         12         98         11         14         14         14         14         15         11 </td <td></td> <td>10</td> <td>-</td>		10	-	
Investigation         19         99           Total         112         121           Enquiry / Complaint issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         89         103           Starf         89         103           Starf         89         103           Staff         89         103           Starf         34         32           VILNE         2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         24         20           Member - Complaint         86         33           RFIE         53         45           Investigation         30         40           Total         193         198           Enquiry / Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         104         121           Service Delivery         112         98           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         56         71           Staff         10         0	Member - Complaint	61	58	
Total112121Enquiry / Complaint IssuesTop Issues2013/20142014/15Staff89103Service Delivery5166Infrastructure and Rolling Stock3432VILNE2013/20142014/15Approaches Received9893Member - Enquiry2420Member - Complaint8693RFIE5345Investigation3040Total193193Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff104121Staff104121Service Delivery11298Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff104121Service Delivery11298Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff104121Service Delivery11298Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff10412110Land82010Ticketing21111Member - Enquiry100Investigation000Investigation000Investigation000Investigation1349Member - Enquiry5378Member - Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Member - Complaint Is	RFIE	22	26	
Enquiry / Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Top Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Strif         89         103           Service Delivery         51         66           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         34         32           VLINE         2013/2014         2014/15           Approaches Received         198         2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         24         20         20           Member - Complaint         86         93         RFIE           Investigation         30         40         0           Total         193         198         198           Enquiry / Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         104         121           Service Delivery         112         98           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         55         71           Land         8         20         1           VICTEACK         2         1         1           Member - Enquiry         1         0         0           VICTEACK         2         1         1      Approaches Received         1 <td< td=""><td>Investigation</td><td>19</td><td>29</td></td<>	Investigation	19	29	
Top Issues2013/20142014/15Staff89103Strike Delivery5166Infrastructure and Rolling Stock3432VLINE2013/20142014/15Approaches Received1982013/2014Member - Enquiry2420Member - Complaint8693RFIE5345Investigation3040Total193198Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff104121Strike Delivery11298Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Strike Delivery11298Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Land8201Wember - Enquiry10Wember - Enquiry10Member - Enquiry10Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Infrastructure and Rolling Stock10VICTACK2013/20142014/15Member - Enquiry10Vertrack20Investigation00Investigation1349RFIE4150Investigation1349Total1349Total1349Investigation1349Intrastructure and Rolling S	Total	112	121	
Top Issues2013/20142014/15Staff89103Strike Delivery5166Infrastructure and Rolling Stock3432VLINE2013/20142014/15Approaches Received1982013/2014Member - Enquiry2420Member - Complaint8693RFIE5345Investigation3040Total193198Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff104121Strike Delivery11298Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Strike Delivery11298Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Land8201Wember - Enquiry10Wember - Enquiry10Member - Enquiry10Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Infrastructure and Rolling Stock10VICTACK2013/20142014/15Member - Enquiry10Vertrack20Investigation00Investigation1349RFIE4150Investigation1349Total1349Total1349Investigation1349Intrastructure and Rolling S	Enquiry / Complaint Issues			
Staff99103Service Delivery5166Infrastructure and Rolling Stock3432V/LINEApproaches Received902013/20142014/15Member - Complaint Received93RFIE6593Investigation3040Total193198Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff104121Service Delivery11298Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Land8200Ticketing2314VICTRACK2013/20142014/15Member - Enquiry10Member - Enquiry5378Member - Enquiry5378Member - Enquiry5393Total231313Member - Enquiry5378Member - Enquiry5378Member - Enquiry5378Member - Enquiry5378Member - Enquiry5378Member - Enquiry5378Member - Enquiry <td></td> <td>2013/2014</td> <td>2014/15</td>		2013/2014	2014/15	
Service Delivery         51         66           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         34         32           VLINE         2013/2014         2014/15           Approaches Received         198         2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         24         20         45           Member - Complaint         86         93         87           Investigation         30         40         103         198           Enquiry / Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15         153         45           Stride Delivery         112         98         17         18         198         198         198         1121         98         11<	Staff			
And reactive and Rolling Stock3432VILNEApproaches Received198Approaches Received2013/20142014/15Member - Enquiry2420Member - Complaint8693RFIE5345Investigation3040Total193198Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff104121Service Delivery11298Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5571Land820Ticketing2314VICTRACK2013/20142014/15Member - Enquiry10Member - Complaint211Approaches Received1RFIE20Investigation00Otal511Member - Complaint21RFIE20Member - Complaint2Staff3149Otal31349Intrastructure and Rolling Stock313English31349Intrastructure31349Intrastructure31349Intrastructure and Rolling Stock71Staff93156Intrastructure and Rolling Stock71Staff93156Intrastructure and Rolling Stock71Staff93156Intrastructure and Rolling Stock71Staff93 <t< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td></t<>				
V/LNE         198           Approaches Received         2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         24         20           Member - Complaint         86         93           RFIE         53         45           Investigation         30         40           Total         193         198           Enquiry / Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         104         121           Service Delivery         112         98           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         56         71           Land         8         20         1           Approaches Received         1         20         1           VICTEACK         2013/2014         2014/15         1           Member - Enquiry         1         0         0         0           Member - Complaint         2         0         1         1         0           Member - Enquiry         1         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0 <td>-</td> <td></td> <td></td>	-			
Approaches Received         198           2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         24         20           Member - Complaint         86         93           Investigation         30         40           Total         30         40           Total         30         40           Staff         104         121           Staff         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         104         121           Staff         203         14           VICTRACK         23         14           VICTRACK         2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         1         0           Member - Enquiry         1         0           Member - Enquiry         1         0           Member - Enquiry         53         18           Member - Enquiry         53         78           Member - Enquiry	-	54	32	
2013/20142014/15Member - Enquiry2420Member - Complaint8693RFIE5345Investigation3040Total193198Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff2013/20142014/15Staff104121Service Delivery11298Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Land820Ticketing2314VICTRACK100Member - Enquiry10Member - Enquiry10Member - Complaint21RFIE200Investigation00Total21Member - Complaint21RFIE2013/20142014/15Member - Complaint21RFIE2013/20142014/15Member - Complaint124136RFIE4150Investigation124136RFIE4150Investigation231313Member - Complaint231313Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff93166Infrastructure and Rolling Stock71132Struke end Rolling Stock71132Struke end Rolling Stock71132Struke end Rolling Stock71132Struke end Rolling Stock71		100		
Member - Enquiry         24         20           Member - Complaint         86         93           RFIE         53         45           Investigation         30         40           Total         193         198           Enquiry / Complaint Issues         104         121           Staff         104         121           Service Delivery         112         98           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         56         71           Land         8         20           Ticketing         23         14           VICTRACK         2013/2014         2014/15           Approaches Received         1         0           Member - Enquiry         1         0           Member - Complaint         2         1           RFIE         2         0           Investigation         0         0           Total         5         1           VARRA TRAMS         2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         53         78           Member - Complaint         124         136           RFIE         41         50           Investigation <t< td=""><td>Approaches Received</td><td></td><td></td></t<>	Approaches Received			
Member - Complaint8693RFIE5345Investigation3040Total3040Total3040Enquiry / Complaint Issues198Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff10412198Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Land820112Iticketing2314VICTRACKApproaches Received1Quiry 20142014/15Member - Enquiry10Member - Complaint21RFIE20Investigation00Total51VIRRA TRAMSVARRA TRAMS2013/20142014/15Member - Enquiry5378Member - Complaint124136RFIE213/20142014/15Investigation1349Total231313Enquiry5378Member - Complaint12436RFIE4150Investigation1349Total231313Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff93156Infrastructure and Rolling Stock71132Service Delivery7175Authorised Officer5869				
RFIE5345Investigation3040Total3040Total193198Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff104121Service Delivery11298Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Land820Ticketing2314VICTRACK10010Member - Enquiry10Member - Complaint21RFIE20Investigation00Total5378Member - Enquiry5378Member - Complaint124136RFIE213/20142014/15Member - Enquiry5378Member - Enquiry5378Member - Enquiry5378Member - Complaint124136RFIE4150Investigation1349Total231313Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Investigation1349Total3349Total33156Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff93156Infrastructure and Rolling Stock711322Service Delivery7175Authorised Officer		24	20	
Investigation         30         40           Total         193         198           Enquiry / Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Top 5 Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         104         121           Service Delivery         112         98           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         56         71           Land         8         20           Ticketing         23         14           VICTRACK         2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         1         0           Member - Complaint Received         1         2           RFIE         2         0         0           Investigation         0         0         0           VERA TRAMS         2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         53         78           Member - Complaint Received         313         49           Total         2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         53         78           Member - Complaint Received         313         49           Total         231         313      Enquiry / Complaint I	Member - Complaint	86	93	
Total         193         198           Enquiry / Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Top 5 Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         104         121           Service Delivery         112         98           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         56         71           Land         8         20           Ticketing         23         14           VICTRACK         2013/2014         2014/15           Approaches Received         1         0           Member - Enquiry         1         0           Member - Complaint         2         1           RFIE         2         0           Investigation         0         0         0           Total         5         1         VICHACK           VARRA TRAMS         2013/2014         2014/15         3           Member - Enquiry         53         78         3           Member - Complaint         124         136         14           Member - Complaint         124         136         14           Member - Complaint         13         49         15           Investigation	RFIE	53	45	
Enquiry / Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Top 5 Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         104         121           Service Delivery         112         98           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         56         71           Land         8         20           Ticketing         23         14           VICTRACK         2013/2014         2014/15           Approaches Received         1         0           Member - Enquiry         1         0           Member - Complaint         2         1           RFIE         2         0           Investigation         0         0         0           VARRA TRAMS         2013/2014         2014/15         1           Member - Enquiry         53         78         78           Member - Complaint         124         136         13           Member - Complaint         124         136         14           Staff         313         49         150         14         150         14         150         15         15         15         15         15         15         15         15	Investigation	30	40	
Top 5 Issues2013/20142014/15Staff104121Service Delivery11298Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Land820Ticketing2314VICTRACKApproaches Received1VICTRACKApproaches Received10Oli3/20142014/15Member - Enquiry10Member - Complaint21RFIE20Investigation00OutputVARRA TRAMSVARRA TRAMSVICTACKTotal5378Member - Enquiry5378Member - Complaint124136RFIE41150Investigation1349Total231313RFIE41150Investigation1349Total2013/20142014/15Staff93156Infrastructure and Rolling Stock71132Staff93156Staff6969	Total	193	198	
Top 5 Issues2013/20142014/15Staff104121Service Delivery11298Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Land820Ticketing2314VICTRACKApproaches Received1VICTRACKApproaches Received10Oli3/20142014/15Member - Enquiry10Member - Complaint21RFIE20Investigation00OutputVARRA TRAMSVARRA TRAMSVICTACKTotal5378Member - Enquiry5378Member - Complaint124136RFIE41150Investigation1349Total231313RFIE41150Investigation1349Total2013/20142014/15Staff93156Infrastructure and Rolling Stock71132Staff93156Staff6969	Enquiry / Complaint Issues			
Staff104121Service Delivery11298Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Land820Ticketing2314VICTRACKVICTRACKApproaches Received1OutstandOutstandApproaches ReceivedImage: Colspan="2">OutstandOutstandMember - Enquiry10Member - Complaint21RFIE20Investigation00Outstand0VARRA TRAMSVARRA TRAMSPropoaches Received31Outstand2013/20142014/15Member - Enquiry5378Member - Complaint124136Investigation1349Investigation13Intal2013/20142014/15Staff93156Staff93156Infrastructure and Rolling Stock71132Service Delivery7175Authorised Officer586969		2013/2014	2014/15	
Service Delivery11298Infrastructure and Rolling Stock5671Land820Ticketing2314VICTRACKApproaches Received1Member - Enquiry10Member - Complaint21RFIE20Investigation00Total51VARRA TRAMSVARRA TRAMSMember - Enquiry5378Member - Enquiry5378Investigation124136RFIE2013/20142014/15Member - Enquiry5378Member - Enquiry5378Total124136RFIE4150Investigation1349Total231313Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff93156Infrastructure and Rolling Stock71132Service Delivery7175Authorised Officer5869	Staff	104	121	
Infrastructure and Rolling Stock 56 71 Land 8 20 Ticketing 23 14 VICTRACK Approaches Received 1 2013/2014 2014/15 Member - Enquiry 1 0 0 Member - Complaint 2 1 RFIE 2 0 Investigation 0 0 0 Total 5 1 YARRA TRAMS Approaches Received 31 VARRA TRAMS Approaches Received 31 VARRA TRAMS Approaches Received 31 VARRA TRAMS Approaches Received 31 VARRA TRAMS Total 50 Investigation 13 49 Service Jossues 2013/2014 2014/15 Staff 93 156 Infrastructure and Rolling Stock 71 32 Service Delivery 71 75 Authorised Officer 58 69	Service Delivery	112		
Land         8         20           Ticketing         23         14           VICTRACK         2013/2014         2014/15           Approaches Received         1         2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         1         0         1           Member - Complaint         2         1         1           RFIE         2         0         0         0           Investigation         0         0         0         0           YARRA TRAMS         2013/2014         2014/15         1           Member - Enquiry         53         78         1           Member - Complaint         124         136         1           Investigation         13         49         1         1           Member - Complaint         13         49         1         1         1           Member - Complaint         13         49         1         36         1				
Ticketing         23         14           VICTRACK         VICTRACK           Approaches Received         1           Quiny Complaint         2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         1         0           Member - Complaint         2         1           RFIE         2         0           Investigation         0         0         0           VARRA TRAMS         313         1           VARRA TRAMS         2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         53         78           Member - Enquiry         53         78           Member - Enquiry         53         78           Member - Complaint         124         136           RFIE         41         50           Investigation         13         49           Total         231         313           Enquiry / Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         93         156           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         71         132           Service Delivery         71         75           Authorised Officer         58         69	-			
VICTRACK           Approaches Received         I           2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         1         0           Member - Complaint         2         1           RFIE         2         0           Investigation         0         0           Total         5         1           YARRA TRAMS         2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         53         78           Member - Enquiry         53         78           Member - Enquiry         53         78           Member - Complaint         124         136           RFIE         41         50           Investigation         13         49           Total         231         313           Enquiry / Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         93         156           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         71         132           Service Delivery         71         75           Authorised Officer         58         69				
Approaches Received12013/20142014/15Member - Enquiry10Member - Complaint21RFIE20Investigation00Total51YARRA TRAMSYARRA TRAMSYARRA TRAMSYOUNT ON TOTAL2013/2014Approaches Received313Member - Enquiry5378Member - Complaint124136RFIE41150Investigation1349Total231313Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff93156Infrastructure and Rolling Stock71132Service Delivery7175Authorised Officer5869		23	14	
2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         1         0           Member - Complaint         2         1           RFIE         2         0           Investigation         0         0         0           Total         5         1         1           YARRA TRAMS         2         1         1           YARRA TRAMS         2         1         1           YARRA TRAMS         2013/2014         2014/15         1           YARRA TRAMS         2013/2014         2014/15         1           YARRA TRAMS         2013/2014         2014/15         1           Member - Enquiry         53         78         1           Member - Complaint         124         136         1           Investigation         13         49         1           Total         231         313         1           Enquiry / Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15         1           Staff         93         156         1           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         71         132           Service Delivery         71         75         1				
Member - Enquiry10Member - Complaint21RFIE20Investigation00Total51YARRA TRAMS313YARRA TRAMS2013/20142014/15Member - Enquiry5378Member - Complaint124136RFIE4150Investigation1349Total2013/20142014/15Staff93156Infrastructure and Rolling Stock71132Service Delivery7175Authorised Officer5869	Approaches Received			
Member - Complaint21RFIE20Investigation00Total51VARRA TRAMS313VARRA TRAMS2013/20142014/15Member - Enquiry5378Member - Complaint124136RFIE4150Investigation1349Total2313313Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff93156Infrastructure and Rolling Stock71132Service Delivery7175Authorised Officer5869				
RFIE20Investigation00Total51VARRA TRAMS313VARRA TRAMS2013/20142014/15Member - Enquiry5378Member - Complaint124136RFIE4150Investigation1349Total231313Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff93156Infrastructure and Rolling Stock71132Service Delivery7175Authorised Officer5869				
Investigation 0 0 Total 5 1 YARRA TRAMS Approaches Received 2013/2014 2014/15 Member - Enquiry 53 78 Member - Complaint 124 136 RFIE 41 50 Investigation 13 49 Total 231 313 Enquiry / Complaint Issues Top 5 Issues 2013/2014 2014/15 Staff 93 156 Infrastructure and Rolling Stock 71 132 Service Delivery 71 75 Authorised Officer 58 69	Member - Complaint	2	1	
Total51VARRA TRAMSApproaches Received3Approaches Received3Member - Enquiry5378Member - Complaint124136RFIE4150Investigation1349Total2013/2014313Enquiry / Complaint Issues2013/20142014/15Staff93156Infrastructure and Rolling Stock71132Authorised Officer5869	RFIE	2	0	
YARRA TRAMS           Approaches Received         313           Approaches Received         2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         53         78           Member - Complaint         124         136           RFIE         41         50           Investigation         13         49           Total         231         313           Enquiry / Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         93         156           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         71         132           Service Delivery         71         75           Authorised Officer         58         69	Investigation	0	0	
Approaches Received         313           2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         53         78           Member - Complaint         124         136           RFIE         41         50           Investigation         13         49           Total         231         313           Enquiry / Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         93         156           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         71         132           Service Delivery         71         75           Authorised Officer         58         69	Total	5	1	
2013/2014         2014/15           Member - Enquiry         53         78           Member - Complaint         124         136           RFIE         41         50           Investigation         13         49           Total         231         313           Enquiry / Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         93         156           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         71         132           Service Delivery         71         75           Authorised Officer         58         69	YARRA TRAMS			
Member - Enquiry         53         78           Member - Complaint         124         136           RFIE         41         50           Investigation         13         49           Total         231         313           Enquiry / Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         93         156           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         71         132           Service Delivery         58         69	Approaches Received	313	1	
Member - Complaint         124         136           RFIE         41         50           Investigation         13         49           Total         231         313           Enquiry / Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         93         156           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         71         132           Service Delivery         58         69			2014/15	
RFIE         41         50           Investigation         13         49           Total         231         313           Enquiry / Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         93         156           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         71         132           Service Delivery         71         75           Authorised Officer         58         69	Member - Enquiry	53	78	
Investigation         13         49           Total         231         313           Enquiry / Complaint Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Top 5 Issues         203         156           Staff         93         156           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         71         132           Service Delivery         71         75           Authorised Officer         58         69	Member - Complaint	124	136	
Total         231         313           Enquiry / Complaint Issues             Top 5 Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         93         156           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         71         132           Service Delivery         71         75           Authorised Officer         58         69	RFIE	41	50	
Total         231         313           Enquiry / Complaint Issues             Top 5 Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         93         156           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         71         132           Service Delivery         71         75           Authorised Officer         58         69	Investigation	13	49	
Enquiry / Complaint IssuesTop 5 Issues2013/20142014/15Staff93156Infrastructure and Rolling Stock71132Service Delivery7175Authorised Officer5869	Total			
Top 5 Issues         2013/2014         2014/15           Staff         93         156           Infrastructure and Rolling Stock         71         132           Service Delivery         71         75           Authorised Officer         58         69				
Staff93156Infrastructure and Rolling Stock71132Service Delivery7175Authorised Officer5869		2012/2014	2014/15	
Infrastructure and Rolling Stock71132Service Delivery7175Authorised Officer5869				
Service Delivery7175Authorised Officer5869				
Authorised Officer 58 <b>69</b>	-			
	-			
General Enquiry 2 7			69	
	General Enquiry	2	7	

### **EXPLORING** THE TOP **COMPLAINT ISSUES:** Penalty fares, fines and Authorised Officers

August 10 2014 saw the introduction of the 12-month trial of the penalty fare option as a lower cost alternative for consumers caught without a valid fare or appropriate evidence of entitlement to concession. This year we received 1214 complaints regarding the issuing of fines and penalty fares, which is an increase of 468. Issues regarding the appeal of a fine were raised 314 times by consumers, which is a 43% increase on last year. Complaints regarding the issuing or appeal of a fine are outside of the jurisdiction of the PTO to investigate; however we considered complaints where consumers believed they were provided confusing or misleading advice by Authorised Officers (AOs) regarding which option they should have chosen.

While having the option of a \$75 on-the-spot fare over a possible fine of \$223 might be better for some consumers, consumers who choose the \$75 penalty fare are told that there is no refund or appeal of a penalty fare. An AO issuing the penalty fare does not take down the consumer's name or address, and the transaction is finalised then and there.

### Although there is no formal appeal process, consumers who have paid a penalty fare can complain to PTV and the PTO.

Currently, consumers who opt to pay the \$75 penalty fare are not provided with any information regarding their right to complain or explain their circumstances. 189 consumers contacted us to complain about the penalty fare, 123 of these complaints were received after January 1, 2015; however it is possible many more may have complained to the PTO had they known they could. There is a lack of information given to consumers about their options when they choose a penalty fare and I am concerned that consumers may wrongly assume that 'no appeal' means they cannot complain to us.

310 complaints contained issues directly relating to the conduct of AO rather than the issuing of a penalty fare or infringement notice. Within these complaints, there were 196 complaints about the AO's manner; slightly more than the 180 recorded last year. Other complaints related to the use of discretion, misleading information or product knowledge. Any enforcement role is difficult and individuals in these roles are often judged unfairly, however it's also important that AOs use discretion appropriately and have the right skills to interact with the community as effectively as possible. To that end, the PTO has provided feedback to PTV following the investigation by the Victorian Ombudsman (VO) entitled Investigation into an incident of alleged excessive force used by authorised officers. In this report VO makes four recommendations which included PTV seeking the assistance of the PTO in its assessment of AO training. In response to a request from PTV we undertook a comprehensive review of AO complaints to our office and provided them with our feedback.

Our feedback highlighted the need for AOs to be given more consistent and improved training regarding the provision of information to consumers, the use of discretion, and to have greater understanding of the PTO so they can explain our role in disputes or complaints relating to a penalty fare.

I and most of the PTO staff have had the opportunity to 'shadow' AO's on the job and we observed that in the majority of cases AO's engage really positively with the community. AO's provide a necessary customer service function as well as an important enforcement role and I welcome the decision by PTV to improve AO training and encourage a stronger customer service focus.



This year we've received 1214 complaints regarding the issuing of fines and penalty fares, which is a 43% increase on last year.

### Penalty fares going forward

The PTO has been asked to provide feedback to PTV's review of the penalty fare trial period.

The PTO's view is that a revenue protection system should be fair, reasonable and aligned with good industry practice and the principle of access to justice. The PTO has identified a number of issues that it believes impact how fair and reasonable the system is:

- Consumers are required to make an on-the-spot decision without necessarily having enough information about their liability and any defences that may be available to them. Some people said they found the experience of talking to AOs distressing and a difficult situation in which to make an informed decision.
- Current messaging around the penalty fare system can mislead consumers into believing they have no options if they wish to dispute a penalty fare. Consumers should be advised of their right to complaint about penalty fares to PTV and the PTO. The obvious way to ensure this is done consistently is via written material provided to consumers at the time they accept a penalty fare.
- The current transport infringement regime is effectively a two tiered system - advocacy groups complain to us that consumers who do not have the means to pay on the spot are penalised because they cannot choose a \$75 penalty fare in preference to an infringement notice of \$223.



### Michael complained to us about a penalty fare.

He believed he successfully touched on his myki at a suburban train station before boarding a train; however he was unable to exit the myki barriers at Southern Cross station and approached customer service officers for help. He was directed to AOs who issued him with the penalty fare of \$75 for travelling without a valid ticket. He complained to the PTO on the basis that the myki reader at the local station must be faulty. Michael claimed that he touched on his myki and the myki reader displayed the message that his touch on was successful. PTV declined his request for a refund so the PTO investigated the matter.

The PTO reviewed CCTV footage from Michael's local station which showed Michael holding his myki to the reader for a few seconds and looking at the screen. The footage does not capture what is on the screen or the audio. PTV reported that device reports showed that there unable to determine why a successful touch on was not recorded. PTV maintained its position that Michael made an informed decision to pay a penalty fare after travelling without a valid ticket, and as such Michael was not entitled to a refund.

However the PTO accepted in good faith Michael's statement that the myki reader displayed a 'touch on successful' message after he touched on. The CCTV footage supported his claim that he had taken reasonable steps to touch on his myki and travel with a valid ticket and he had a positive balance on his myki. After looking at all the circumstances, the PTO concluded that Michael did not knowingly travel without a valid ticket and that he took reasonable steps to ensure his ticket was valid.

After further discussions with the PTO, PTV agreed to make a goodwill payment of \$75 to Michael and the complaint was resolved.

# Case Study

# **Myki** is the **reloadable smartcard ticketing system** for much of Victoria's public transport system.

### Smartcard systems are the new standard in public transport ticketing across Australia

There is the SmartRider in Western Australia. The go card in Queensland and more recently, the introduction of the Opal card in New South Wales. In Victoria myki is used for all metropolitan tram, train and bus services within ticketing zones 1 and 2, as well as some V/Line and regional bus services.

Implementation of myki began in 2011 and complaints to our office about myki reached a peak of 2,710 in 2012/2013. Since that time, myki complaints numbers have been steadily falling. While myki is not without its problems, there is a sense that the system is bedding down as consumers in Victoria become used to the requirement to 'top up, touch on and touch off' their mykis

The past year has seen a drop in the number of myki complaints to our office from 1377 cases in 2013/2014 to 1175 cases this year. We have a seen a decrease in complaints about general myki issues such as terms and conditions, but an increase of 18% in the number of myki staff/customer service issues.

Refund and reimbursements were the most significant cause of complaint to the PTO. Typically consumers apply for a refund or reimbursement when a top up to their myki has failed or they believe they have been overcharged. Consumers largely complained about their refund/ reimbursement being declined or delayed. Customer service and staff issues were the second most common issue and often raised in conjunction with another issue such as refund/reimbursement or myki account issues.

Systemic issues identified through myki complaints are registered in our myki issues register. We talk in more detail about the myki issues register on **page 33**.

# Case Study

### Pradeep attempted to top up his myki at a Card Vending Machine (CVM) at a tram stop. His myki was not credited, but \$126 was debited from his bank account.

He contacted the PTV Call Centre on 23 October and was advised to send them a copy of his bank statement showing the debit of \$126 to support his claim for a refund. After he resent his bank account information twice, PTV initiated an investigation and confirmed with the system contractor that it was a case of inadvertent myki purchase. This means that instead of topping up his myki, Pradeep inadvertently purchased a new myki for \$6 which was then topped up with \$120 and in all likelihood taken from the CVM by another consumer.

On 10 November Pradeep was advised that matter would need to be escalated within PTV for further response. The customer contacted the PTO on 1 December to make a complaint as he had not received a further response from PTV. Because Pradeep had had a number of contacts with PTV, the complaint was allocated for investigation.

PTV responded to the PTO and apologised for not providing a timely response. PTV looked at the travel history report for the inadvertently purchased myki and advised that the travel history was distinctly different to Pradeep's travel history. PTV was confident that Pradeep was unaware of the inadvertent purchase, and someone else found the myki in the CVM and used it. PTV arranged to have \$126 myki money credited to Pradeep's myki and the complaint was resolved.

P2014/4000



# Service delivery is always a source of complaints: This year we received **853 complaints**

regarding service delivery which is a decrease of 70



Joanne attended Winchelsea train station to catch a train to Melbourne. On arrival at the station, she found a notice advising that due to track works, a coach replacement service was operating.

The notice didn't indicate timetable or route details other than to advise passengers to expect delays of up to 40 minutes. It also didn't specify the departure location for the replacement service. As V/Line's regular coach service normally operates from a bus stop in town Joanne thought she should wait there.

When the coach replacement service arrived, it drove straight past her.

Joanne said the incident caused her a great deal of confusion and stress. She contacted V/Line through PTV a number of times seeking an explanation and then contacted us because she was dissatisfied with their response.

Following investigation by our office, we established that the replacement coach service operates as both express and stopping all stations. The coach seen by Joanne was an express service. We confirmed that the notice did not contain advice about which services were express or where to wait for the replacement coach.

V/Line acknowledged the issues highlighted by the complaint and advised that future communications about replacement coach service would include information about where consumers should wait for these services.

V/Line also acknowledged that information provided to Joanne by their customer feedback team was not clear and likely to cause confusion.

In recognition of the inconvenience and distress to Joanne, V/Line offered Joanne a complimentary travel voucher as a goodwill gesture Joanne accepted V/Line's offer and the case was closed.

# WORKING WITH OUR MEMBERS TO IMPROVE THE SYSTEM

This year the PTO has worked collaboratively with our members to identify areas for improvement.

These issues are usually identified through our complaint handling work as a problem that might be affecting more than one person. They could represent problems like a system fault, a poor policy or something that might disadvantage certain members of the community.

The PTO drew nine potential improvement opportunities to operators' attention and in six cases improvements were implemented or scheduled. These are opportunities for operators to make an improvement or solve a problem without the need for the PTO to investigate the issue.

# **IMPROVEMENT OPPORTUNITIES**

P2015/1423



### **Improvement** Opportunities

-			
SHORT TITLE	Description	Corrective action	Status
Metro trains – Driver provides passengers with assistance to board and alight trains.	Inefficient driver reminder system. Sometimes consumers are forgotten and miss their stop because of oversight or poor communication at driver changeover.	Metro advised that iPads would be issued to drivers with the facility to enter reminders for stations along the route.	Closed. Continuous improvement action to be implemented. The PTO will monitor progress once implemented.
PTV unavailable via advertised TTY number (a service for people with hearing or speech impairment).	A consumer contacted us to complain that the advertised TTY number at the PTV call centre was not available.	PTV arranged for a new phone line to be installed at the call centre and the TTY service was resumed.	Closed. Continuous improvement action implemented.
V/Line customers and Zone 1 and 2 changes.	V/Line customers were not receiving the benefit of the Zone 1 and 2 fare changes when metropolitan consumers were charged a maximum of the Zone 1 fare.	PTV advised that this was a policy decision of the Government.	Closed. No corrective action from V/Line required.
Consumer in wheelchair denied access to carriage because of trailer.	A consumer complained that he was advised by different Metro train drivers that he should not have a trailer on his wheelchair and they could refuse to carry him.	Metro advised that it is a safety issue; with the trailer his wheelchair may not fit in the designated area so he can travel safely.	Closed. No corrective action PTO accepted Metro's advice.
Clear explanation and promotion of the benefit of myki pass.	Consumers have complained to the PTO that they were unaware of the option to travel using a myki pass, and as a result they had paid more than they should for their travel.	PTV advised that it will be undertaking a media campaign to support uptake of myki passes.	Closed. Continuous improvement action to be monitored by the PTO.
School children unable to travel on buses because they do not have a valid ticket.	The PTO looked at whether PTV had an obligation to carry these children, and reviewed the 'no child left behind' approach in Queensland.	PTV advised that it is a subjective decision to be made by a bus driver taking into account the circumstances at the time with reference to objective standards.	Closed. PTV to reinforce obligations with bus operators.
PTV not accepting overseas credit cards or transactions originating overseas.	Consumers complained to us that they were unable to use their overseas credit cards to undertake online myki transactions.	PTV advised that this was as a result of a new policy around overseas credit cards to address significant fraud involving myki. Consumers can use overseas credit cards at myki retailers.	Closed. No corrective action from PTV required.
Information and process regarding the expiry of unused myki pass after 12 months.	Some consumers reported difficulty in getting a refund of the funds on their unused myki pass that had expired.	PTV sends notification to registered myki holders of pending expiry. All unused passes can be refunded, and PTV agreed to revise its messaging around this issue.	Open. Continuous improvement action proposed. PTV will brief the PTO on the new messaging to consumers.
Point of sale information about conditions of concession travel.	The PTO investigated a significant number of complaints from students aged over 17 about the availability of information about a Victorian Public Transport Concession Card (VPT) card which is a requirement for valid concession travel. Many thought their school or university issued student card would be enough proof of their entitlement to concession travel.	PTV is developing information to be provided to consumers at the point of sale about what is required for each category of concession travel. This will be supported by training of staff involved in the sale of myki products. This issue is ongoing.	Open. Continuous improvement action proposed. PTV to brief PTO on progress of its review of point of sale information.

# Example of a continuous **improvement** opportunity

### Unclear or inadequate information about concession entitlements is a complaint that we regularly receive.

For example, the concession requirements for students who are over 17 years of age, students must purchase a Victorian Public Transport (VPT) concession card to travel with a concession myki (separate scheme is available to overseas students).

Students often say they are sold a concession myki without being advised of the requirement for a VPT concession card. A number of consumers who made this complaint to us had also paid a penalty fare.

This issue was identified by us as a continuous improvement opportunity for PTV as the authority responsible for myki. Our view is that this is an opportunity to improve staff training and the provision of information about student concessions more generally.

PTV acknowledged the issue and advised it was exploring options for simplifying concessional travel for students.

discussions with PTV on these measures.

We welcome PTV's advice that it is considering a range of options; one of which is developing new information about concessional travel that will be available at the point of sale. We continue to have

### myki Issues

SHORT TITLE	Description	Corrective action	Status
Malfunction of AO's myki handheld devices.	During an investigation the PTO reviewed footage of a consumer touching on his myki yet, when challenged by an AO, the AO's handheld device did not reflect this. The PTO felt that there may be a wider issue around the reliability of the handheld devices on which AOs rely.	The PTO has now upgraded this to a systemic issue and is now conducting a broader investigation.	Open.
Incomplete Card vending machine (CVM) transactions, consumers left out of pocket.	We received a number of complaints about unsuccessful myki transactions at card vending machines. Consumers have been left out of pocket because they have not realised their transaction was unsuccessful and didn't obtain a refund or some have purchased the wrong product, such as another myki card rather than a top-up.	PTV commenced a major review of card vending machines. PTV will confirm to the PTO its proposed changes to process and messaging on device displays.	Closed. Continuous improvement action to be implemented.
Availability time of myki passes is unclear.	Consumers are advised to allow at least 24 hours for the pass to be applied to the myki, however sometimes a pass will become active well before that time and a consumer may unnecessarily use myki money for travel.	PTV will improve the messaging regarding activation so consumers know to check activation of their pass before using myki money.	Continuous improvement action to be implemented.
myki pass balance transfer delay of three days.	PTO asked PTV why this can't be done instantaneously.	PTV advised that this is a system requirement to ensure all transactions are completed prior to refund. The PTO accepted this response.	Closed.

# myki issues register

System problems relating to myki can have a really detrimental effect on consumers, such as potentially being wrongly fined for not having a valid myki or being inconvenienced or confused because of a problem with readers or vending machines. We created a myki issues register and worked proactively with PTV on solving possible hardware or software problems we identified relating to the ticketing system. We raised four issues, one is still under review, two improvement actions are under consideration and one was found to have no functional error.

Public Transport Ombudsman Annual Report 2015



Some issues were more systemic and required deeper investigation. This year we found four issues to be systemic in nature. Three corrective actions have been put in place and one issue remains unresolved.

### Systemic Issues

SHORT TITLE	Description	Corrective action	Status
PTV ban on touching on with a negative myki balance (see case study).	Consumers whose myki goes into a negative balance after paying for a full day's travel are unable to touch on again without putting more myki money on their myki. The PTO has developed the view that this is unfair, as the cost of the further travel has already been debited. PTO is also concerned that consumers who load a pass onto a myki with a negative myki money balance are unable to activate their pass, and the card vending machine does not alert them to this fact.	PTO has asked PTV to reconsider its position, and PTV has advised that it is reviewing aspects of the myki ticketing policy which may address this issue.	Open. PTO and PTV continue to discuss this issue.
CVM top up applied to next customer.	Several consumers found that their attempt to top up their myki at a card vending machine failed, but their bank account was debited. In each case, the payment was credited to the next consumer's myki. PTV advised that these consumers were the target of fraudulent activity made possible by a particular payment facility at card vending machine.	PTV adjusted the functionality of card vending machine software and the issue was resolved.	Closed.
PTV myki barrier policy and its effect on access pass holders (access pass holders do not use a myki because they have special circumstances which make using a myki difficult).	A consumer with a vision impairment accompanied by a guide dog was repeatedly delayed while waiting for assistance at myki barriers during peak times. This delay is due to a change of policy because of the introduction of new generation myki barriers at her station. PTV's policy is that all unattended barriers are closed. Access pass holders traditionally access the platform through open or staffed barriers; however at her station all barriers are closed and not directly staffed.	PTV has made changes to the policy. The wide barriers will now be open during peak times to ensure compliance with to the Disability Standards for Accessible Public Transport 2002. Other staff training will also be undertaken.	Closed.
V/Line's process for booking journeys for customers with special needs.	A lack of familiarity at the PTV call centre about the process and policies for special needs bookings often leads to consumers being placed on hold for too long, bookings failing, inconsistent information about facilities and the ability to reserve seats and in the more serious cases - bookings being made on inaccessible services.	V/Line reviewed and amended its call centre processes and training. The PTO monitored this to ensure the changes become embedded practice.	Closed.

# MYKI ISSUE UPGRADED TO A SYSTEMIC ISSUE INVESTIGATION

In May we identified an issue that had the potential to disadvantage a significant number of myki users.

Current ticketing policy allows a myki to go into a debit balance. However it is not possible to touch on a myki if it has a balance below zero.

We have identified two circumstances in which this unfairly affects consumers:

1. Where a consumer has reached the daily fare cap but their myki has gone into a negative balance. This means they cannot continue to travel even though they have had the fare for a full day of travel debited from their myki.

2. A consumer who purchases a myki pass cannot activate the pass if they have a negative myki money balance.

Consumers in these circumstances are unable to touch on their myki to ensure they have a valid ticket. Without a valid ticket they cannot open the barrier gates, or if they do travel they might risk receiving a fine or paying a penalty fare. Our concern is that this issue may disproportionately affect children and students who may not have ready funds to immediately top up, and leave them unable to travel.

It seems unfair that for a debt of as little as 1 cent, a consumer is unable to travel, even though they have been charged, or in the case of a pass attempted to pay for their travel.

We identified the matter as a systemic issue and referred the matter to PTV for their response.

PTV has advised us that it is exploring policy changes to the ticketing system that may address these issues. We are continuing our discussion with PTV on this issue and await a briefing on the proposed changes.

# WORKING WITH THE COMMUNITY

Being a valued resource for the community means ensuring people know about the scheme and our processes, as well as being viewed as efficient and fair.

Consumers continue to be highly satisfied with the service of the PTO and we remain an important forum of last resort for complaint resolution.

We spend time out in the community, in particular talking to organisations that represent the interests of various public transport users, such as community legal centres, disability advocates and migrant, student and youth representatives. PTO staff listen to the experiences and needs of these groups and we provide tailored information to improve their experience using public transport and what to do if they have a complaint.

# WHO CONTACTED US

48.5% female | 51.5% male 90.5% metropolitan | 9.5% regional

# HOW PEOPLE GOT IN TOUCH

44% phone 53% email & online complaint form 3% letter or fax



# **PTO WEBSITE** VISITORS

Traffic to the PTO website generated by first time visitors is increasing, while total visitors decreased slightly compared to last year. This growth reinforces the need to ensure the PTO provides useful, easy to understand information for first time visitors.

We are reviewing our content and layout and hope to relaunch the site with a refreshed look and feel in 2016.

We also plan to launch the PTO facebook page in late 2015 to engage with a new audience as part of our accessibility and awareness approach.



# **WHERE** PEOPLE SAID THEY'D HEARD ABOUT THE PTO:





# CUSTOMER SATISFACTION SURVEY

How our service was rated by the consumers who used our services.



# FAIR & IMPARTIAL

88% of respondents said their complaint was handled fairly and impartially, that's a 15% increase from the previous survey

## OTHER ACTIVITIES **RELATED TO OUR WORK**

### The Benchmarks Review

The Benchmarks for Industry-based Customer Dispute Resolution Schemes (CDR Benchmarks) were established in 1997 to encourage best practice in industry-based dispute resolution services. The CDR Benchmarks of accessibility, independence, fairness, accountability, efficiency and effectiveness are incorporated into the Charter of the PTO and formed the basis of the recent independent review of our office.

Following a comprehensive review, a revised version of the CDR Benchmarks was adopted by the Commonwealth Consumer Affairs Advisory Council and released by the Department of Treasury in February 2015. The relevance of the CDR Benchmarks was reaffirmed.

### The CCAAC considers that the CDR Benchmarks retain ongoing relevance for industry dispute resolution schemes across the economy.

As a consequence of the review there is now also a Key Practices document which provides practical guidance on meeting the CDR Benchmarks. The Key Practices are intended to be a 'living document' that can easily be changed in response to technology and community changes. For example, there is a Key Practice requiring schemes to reduce virtual barriers to complaints by providing consumers with 24 hours access options such as online complaint forms.

We have reviewed our policies and practices to make sure we are meeting the Key Practices and pleasingly, we do. For example we have a conflict of interest policy and a closed case review process to ensure fairness and independence.

Public Transport Ombudsman Annual Report 2015

15% IMPROVEMENT

FROM THE PREVIOUS SURVEY

### Access to Justice Arrangements Inquiry

The recent Productivity Commission report released in December 2014 into Access to Justice Arrangements was overwhelmingly positive about the benefits of industry-based Ombudsman Schemes. The PTO made written and verbal submissions to the Commission on the benefits of industry-based Ombudsman Schemes, particularly in relation to low value disputes. Many of the complaints to our office involve values of less than \$20, and going to a tribunal or court is not an appropriate option for those consumers.

The report found that industry-based Ombudsman Schemes promote access to justice by helping to overcome power imbalances between consumers and service providers, resolving both legal and non-legal issues and providing a process that is easy to use and proportionate to the problem experienced

The report also found that the identifying and addressing of systemic issues to be an efficient form of dispute resolution as they have the potential to address all instances of a fault in the one process.

The Commission suggested that Ombudsman Schemes should be more visible to the community so they can be more widely accessed. Better directing of consumers to Ombudsman Schemes could significantly reduce the level of unmet legal need in the community. This is in line with our focus following our recent independent review; which made recommendations regarding increasing our outreach and awareness building of our services.

# HOW WE **PERFORMED**

We received a total of 4079 approaches and closed 4125 with 48 open investigations as at 30 June 2015

# DAYS TO **FINALISE** INVESTIGATIONS

Investigation	2013/14	2014/15
≤45 Days	68%	<b>59%</b>
≤60 Days	79%	<b>79%</b>
≤90 Days	93%	93%
≤6 Months	98%	99%
≥ 6 months	2%	1%

The PTO has continued to ensure investigated matters are handled efficiently however the lower numbers of early closures is indicative of the increased complexity of the investigations, particularly when we may need to obtain evidence such as CCTV footage or myki data.

# OUR PEOPLE

Our organisation is staffed by dedicated and professional people who have a mix of backgrounds, including law, customer service and social services. Some of the team are undertaking study, which is something the PTO is very supportive of. This year we have focused training and development activities

## **The PTO** has 12 staff including the Ombudsman

Conciliators

on improving our conciliation skills and being more efficient in our processes. We have also spent time learning more about our members' businesses and providing members with training on our processes as well as techniques for effective dispute resolution.



### SUMMARY FINANCIAL STATEMENTS

The following is a concise version of the Financial Report for the Public Transport Ombudsman Ltd. for the year ending 30 June 2015. The financial statements and specific disclosures contained in this concise financial report have been derived from the full financial report and the concise financial report cannot be expected to provide as full an understanding of the financial performance, financial position and financing and investing activities of the entity as the financial report.

### **Discussion and analysis of the Comprehensive Income Statement**

### **Revenue from ordinary activities**

Revenue for the period ending 30 June 2015 was \$1,873,177. This was derived from three sources:

- Annual Levies from Members: \$1.845.269.
- Interest Income: \$24,508; and
- Other Income: \$3,400.

### **Operating Expenses**

Operating Expenses for the period ending 30 June 2015 were \$1,823,582. The majority of operating expenses were employee benefits (\$1,341,231), Telephone and IT expenses (\$115,040) and occupancy expenses (\$109,979).

### Income Tax

**Total Liabilities** 

The Australian Taxation Office ("ATO") issued a private tax ruling during 2004/05 financial year declaring that the company is deemed exempt from income tax and has an FBT rebateable status. The private ruling has been extended to 30 June 2018.

### Discussion and analysis of the Statement of Financial Position

#### **Total Assets**

Total assets increased by \$76,252 during the period due primarily to an increase in total current assets of \$99,209 and a decrease in non-current assets of (\$22,957).

Total Liabilities increased by \$26,657 during the period. This is due to an increase in total current liabilities of \$30,654 and decrease in non-current liabilities of (\$3,997).

### Discussion and analysis of the statement of cash flows

#### **Cash Flows from Operating Activities**

Cash at the end of the financial year as shown in the statements of cash flows is \$1,228,715. This was derived from:

Cash inflow from operating activities \$87,427;

- Cash outflow from investing activities (\$37,143); and
- Cash and cash equivalents at the beginning of financial year \$1,178,431.

Audited Financial Statements and Directors' Report for the Public Transport Ombudsman Limited have been lodged with ASIC in accordance with the Corporations Act requirements.

### **Comprehensive Income Statement**

For the year ended 30 June 2015	2015 \$	2014 \$
<b>Continuing operations</b> Revenue from annual levies	1,845,269	1,789,357
Non-operating activities Interest income Other income	24,508 3,400	21,898 19,550
Total income	1,873,177	1,830,805
Expenses from ordinary activities Depreciation and amortisation expense Employee benefits expense Occupancy costs Telephone and IT expenses Consultancy expenses	60,099 1,341,231 109,979 115,040 69,589	54,193 1,294,349 123,977 106,653 57,931
Other expenses from ordinary activities	127,644	160,175
Surplus/(Deficit) from ordinary activities before income tax expense	49,595	33,527
Income tax expense relating to ordinary activities Surplus/(Deficit) for the period from continuing operations Other comprehensive income for the year	49,595	33,527
Total comprehensive income for the year	49,595	33,527

### **Statement of Financial Position** As at 30 June 2015

### **Current assets**

Cash and cash equivalents Trade and other receivables

### Total current assets

Non-current assets Office equipment Total non-current assets

Total assets

### **Current liabilities**

Trade and other payables Provisions

**Total current liabilities** 

Non-current liabilities Trade and other payables Provisions

**Total non-current liabilities** 

**Total liabilities** 

#### Net assets

Equity Retained surplus **Total equity** 

### Statement of Changes in Equity For the year ended 30 June 2015

### Total Equity at the beginning of the financial year Total comprehensive income for the year

### Total Equity at the end of the financial year

### Statement of Cash Flow For the year ended 30 June 2015

#### CASH FLOWS FROM OPERATING ACTIVITIES

**Receipts from Members** Payments to suppliers and employees Interest received

#### Net cash inflow from operating activities

#### CASH FLOWS FROM INVESTING ACTIVITIES

Payments office equipment Proceeds from office equipment Purchase of Intangible assets

#### Net cash (outflow) from investing activities

#### Net increase in cash and cash equivalents

Cash and cash equivalents at the beginning of financial year

#### Cash and cash equivalents at the end of financial year

2015 \$	2014 \$	
1,228,715	1,178,431	
327,883 <b>1,556,598</b>	278,958 <b>1,457,389</b>	
194,513 194,513	217,470 217,470	
1,751,111	1,674,859	
1,245,662 33,152	1,202,919 45,241	
1,278,814	1,248,160	
13,493 9,756	16,909 10,337	
23,249	27,246	
1,302,063	1,275,406	
499,048	399,453	
499,048	399,453	
499,048	399,453	

2015 \$	2014 \$
399,453	365,926
49,545	33,527
449,048	399,453
49,048	399,453

,	
399,453	
399,453	

2014

2015

Ş	Ŷ
1,793,956	2,154,336
(1,731,037)	(1,649,514)
24,508	21,898
87,427	526,720
(26,633)	(113,583)
590	-
(11,100)	(43,750)
(37,143)	(157,343)
50,284	369,377
1,178,431	809,054
1,228,715	1,178,431

### Call Us

### Free Call\* 1800 466 865

\*(Free from landlines, standard rates apply for calls from mobiles). If you call from a mobile you can ask us to call you back.

### National Relay Service (NRS)

If you are deaf, or have a hearing or speech impairment you can contact us by:

Contacting the National Relay Service
 http://relayservice.gov.au/support/training/nrs-call-numbers/

• Providing the Public Transport Ombudsman number you want to call (1800 466 865).

For more information, visit: http://www.relayservice.gov.au

### Telephone Interpreter Service (TIS) 131 450

Administration (03) 8623 2111

Fax (03) 8623 2100

### Mail Address

Public Transport Ombudsman PO Box 538 Collins Street West MELBOURNE VIC 8007

